

Message

From: Manzanilla, Enrique [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=0482B3CC383348B887A1800BC40C0A72-EMANZANI]
Sent: 4/8/2021 10:41:48 PM
To: JOHN LYONS (Lyons.John@epa.gov) [Lyons.John@epa.gov]; Quast, Sylvia [Quast.Sylvia@epa.gov]; Alpern, Michael [Alpern.Michael@epa.gov]; John Chesnutt (Chesnutt.John@epa.gov) [Chesnutt.John@epa.gov]
CC: Helmlinger, Andrew [Helmlinger.Andrew@epa.gov]; Huang, Judy [Huang.Judy@epa.gov]; HERRERA, ANGELES [herrera.angeles@epa.gov]; Barton, Dana [barton.dana@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: Meeting with State of California colleagues and NOAA's letter to Senator Feinstein
Importance: High

Here's my draft response to Nancy, Comments and edits are welcome.... I will attach relevant material after I receive your comments.

Also, look at Nancy's second email which she just sent to me. And I know there was a separate lawyer discussion earlier today.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Closing.....

From: Nancy Hann - NOAA Federal [mailto:Nancy.Hann@noaa.gov]

Sent: Thursday, April 8, 2021 6:37 AM

To: Manzanilla, Enrique <Manzanilla.Enrique@epa.gov>; Walker Smith - NOAA Federal <walker.smith@noaa.gov>; Jeff Dillen - NOAA Federal <jeff.dillen@noaa.gov>

Subject: Re: Meeting with State of California colleagues and NOAA's letter to Senator Feinstein

Good morning Enrique,

I appreciate the partnership and great conversation. Thank you for coordinating with the State partners. Yes, next Tuesday (4/13) at 4pm EDT works well. I put it on the schedule and will invite NOAA colleagues. I will plan to present the same slides and leave plenty of time for discussion. I asked to share the slides - the person who did them at Scripps is on leave this week and I'll check in with him first thing next week for an answer.

Thank you for pointing out the language in the memo. I will share it with our Legislative shop. I didn't review the latest response but will make sure we coordinate future responses with EPA. It was certainly eye-opening how many sources the identified targets may have come from and the complexity of the historical sources, records, responses, etc.

Recent updates and for discussion: Scripps is working with Senator Feinstein on a Congressional briefing for 4/23. Per Scripps, "the plan is for David Valentine on 2011-13 findings, Eric Terrill (lead Scripps scientist on the recent survey), and an ecosystem DDT impacts expert tbd right now. For ecosystem, I am talking to someone from San Diego State U." Scripps said we (Feds) would be invited if they want to say what they will do next, or they can proceed without. Based on your recent comments, the comment about DDT caught my attention as it seems from the conversation we had this week, it is not certain what is in the targets and where they came from. Do you want me to schedule a call with us and Scripps to discuss? Scripps is looking at a media briefing, the week of 4/26 and maybe 4/26 that week. The Scripps comms office just starting to work on this and will be in touch to discuss what/how/if NOAA wants to participate. I think we should loop EPA comms in, too. Do you agree? There is a CBS Saturday morning previously filmed piece that may run this Saturday (Scripps commented on this, NOAA did not).

Looking forward to talking soon. Let me know based on the above updates if you want to have a call with us prior to the State partner meeting. I've looped in Walker and Jeff.

Best regards,

Nancy

On Thu, Apr 8, 2021 at 12:38 AM Manzanilla, Enrique <Manzanilla.Enrique@epa.gov> wrote:

Good evening Admiral Hann:

I certainly appreciated the presentation yesterday. We have a complex road ahead of us on this issue. I appreciate your willingness to explore additional assessment efforts by NOAA.

John Lyons has been making some headway on the meeting with our state colleagues from Cal EPA, the State Water Resources Control Board, Regional Water Quality Control Board, the Resources Agency, and the Department of Toxic Substances Control. It looks like we are gravitating towards next Tuesday, April 13 at 1 PM PDT (4 PM EDT). Could you and/or your staff accommodate that time? As we discussed, the group would benefit from the same presentation you led yesterday. And I'm sure the discussion afterwards will be robust. Again, let us know if the time and day work for you and your NOAA colleagues.

Today, my staff received the signed response (attached) from Deputy Under Secretary Friedman to Senator Feinstein. We appreciate you sharing the letter. The following statement and yellow highlighted phrase caught my attention:

"In our role on the Montrose Trustee Council, NOAA, along with EPA and the State of California, is working to complete restoration within the Palos Verdes Shelf and provide technical assistance to EPA on its ongoing investigation and remediation of DDT contamination at the deep ocean disposal sites."

As we discussed yesterday, we at EPA are very far from any type of formal investigation and remediation at the deep ocean disposal sites. In looking at a previous version of the draft response which was shared last month with my staff (attached) by our NOAA colleagues, it appears the statement at issue in the final signed letter conflated our role on the Palos Verde Shelf portion of the NPL site. We at EPA will need to clarify this statement in the course of our discussions and communications with the Senator's office, our EPA Headquarters offices, and any other recipients of the letter; I would respectfully ask that your office do the same when an opportunity presents itself.

I do appreciate the collegial approach during the course of our discussion yesterday. That approach will be critical as we move to our collective discussions with our state colleagues and a notional plan of next steps.

I welcome your insights and advice going forward. Please feel free to call me anytime.

Best Regards,

Enrique Manzanilla

Director, Superfund and Emergency Management Division

US EPA Region 9 - Pacific Southwest

(415) 972 3843

(415) 601-2670 mobile

From: Chesnutt, John

Sent: Wednesday, April 7, 2021 2:58 PM

To: Manzanilla, Enrique <Manzanilla.Enrique@epa.gov>; Lyons, John <Lyons.John@epa.gov>; Herrera, Angeles <Herrera.Angeles@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: NOAA response to Senator Feinstein

From: Laurie Sullivan - NOAA Federal <laurie.sullivan@noaa.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, April 7, 2021 1:39 PM

To: Chesnutt, John <Chesnutt.John@epa.gov>; Huang, Judy <Huang.Judy@epa.gov>

Cc: Jennifer Boyce - NOAA Federal <jennifer.boyce@noaa.gov>; Amy.Merten@noaa.gov; Christopher Plaisted <Christopher.Plaisted@noaa.gov>

Subject: Fwd: NOAA HQ AUTOPEN REQUEST: DDT pollution off the California coast (Folder 21-072911)

Hi John and Judy-- here is another signed Feinstein letter. NOT sure if this is from the original request or a follow-up.

L

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Michael Jarvis - NOAA Federal <michael.jarvis@noaa.gov>

Date: Wed, Apr 7, 2021 at 12:21 PM

Subject: Fwd: NOAA HQ AUTOPEN REQUEST: DDT pollution off the California coast (Folder 21-072911)

To: Samantha Guidon <samantha.berkowitz@noaa.gov>, Shawn Choy - NOAA Federal <shawn.choy@noaa.gov>, Christopher Plaisted - NOAA Federal <christopher.plaisted@noaa.gov>, Amy Merten - NOAA Federal <amy.merten@noaa.gov>, Brianne Szczepanek <Brianne.Szczepanek@noaa.gov>, Lindsey Kraatz <Lindsey.Kraatz@noaa.gov>, Jennifer Steger - NOAA Federal <jennifer.steger@noaa.gov>, Sunny Snider - NOAA Federal

<sunny.snider@noaa.gov>, Jennifer Boyce - NOAA Federal <jennifer.boyce@noaa.gov>, Katherine Nielsen - NOAA Federal <katherine.nielsen@noaa.gov>, Alexis Cunningham - NOAA Affiliate <alexis.cunningham@noaa.gov>, Scott Lundgren - NOAA Federal <scott.lundgren@noaa.gov>, Wendy Lewis - NOAA Federal <wendy.lewis@noaa.gov>, Laurie Sullivan - NOAA Federal <Laurie.Sullivan@noaa.gov>, Tom Brosnan - NOAA Federal <tom.brosnan@noaa.gov>, Tony Penn - NOAA Federal <tony.penn@noaa.gov>

Cc: Alexis Gutierrez - NOAA Federal <alexis.gutierrez@noaa.gov>, Katherine Dziedzic - NOAA Affiliate <katherine.dziedzic@noaa.gov>, Becky Lizama - NOAA Federal <becky.lizama@noaa.gov>, Mackenzie Solomon - NOAA Federal <Mackenzie.Solomon@noaa.gov>, Melanie Jackson - NOAA Federal <melanie.jackson@noaa.gov>

Good Afternoon Everyone,

FYI - The final and signed response to Senator Feinstein's March letter about the DDT survey is attached for your reference. We sent this to the Senator's staff a short while ago. A number of folks have been engaged in this issue these past several months and I hope I included most of this email, but please share as needed.

Thanks,

Mike

--
RDML Nancy Hann, NOAA
Deputy Director for Operations, OMAO and the NOAA Corps
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration